

In Between Spaces:

Detroit Disassembled and the Other Side of Capitalism

Emily Merrill

Thesis Proposal

In partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Masters in Visual Critical Studies

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank Professor Diane Zeeuw and Dr. Karen Carter. Your intelligence, confidence, success and dedication allow the generations of women you educate to see their futures in your examples. Both of you allowed me to see my potential and I will spend the rest of my life giving back this gift to the generations of women who follow me. I will always carry a part of both of you within me. By providing both intellectual and artistic tools you enabled me to realize creativity as a fundamental value. You allowed me to realize my place in society, to envision a life, with purpose, meaning, and honor. Your demand to see the very best in others, your expectations for your students and your classroom instituted that very desire and standard in all of my work. You introduced me to the academic disciplines will dedicate the rest of my life to studying.

I would also like to thank Professor Brad Yarhouse. Your classrooms are such nurturing intellectual environments for your students. It is apparent that you care deeply. Thank you.

I. Abstract

The central question of this thesis is the following: what encoded meanings in modern space's uses are revealed through its depiction in Andrew Moore's photographic anthology *Detroit Disassembled*, and what new meanings can be conveyed by contextualizing ruin imagery within a current assessment of modern space's redevelopment? To answer this question, I will be applying an integrated methodological approach developed by Henri Lefebvre in *The Production of Space* and Edward W. Soja in *Thirdspace: Journeys to Los Angeles and Other Real-and-Imagined Places*. My objective is to interpret images of advanced capitalism within the context of industrial ruination focusing on the adverse sides of functional space, such as entropy, trash and ephemerality. It is my assertion that Moore's images reveal symbolic meanings about capitalism once the abstractions of modern space are upended by decay. I will be concluding this paper by examining a central feature to industrial ruination, temporality and contextualizing it within the larger conversation of space's current redevelopment in the city of Detroit.

II. Introduction

A. Overview

In the latter years of the financial crisis of 2008, photographers, tourist and journalist all descended upon the city of Detroit to record and document a real life drama unfolding—a city in crisis entrenched in both economic and social collapse. Today these representations of Detroit convey a devastating portrait of desolation and destruction foregrounding the loss and collapse of a golden age of America's productivity, prosperity, and strength. Detroit resident and scholar Jerry Herron in *After Culture: Detroit and the Humiliation of History* describes these representations of Detroit contending they deliver “A singular, cautionary disaster from which people elsewhere imagine they still have time to retreat.”¹ Richard Woodward in “Disaster Photography: When is Documentary Exploitation?” describes Detroit's ruin imagery within

context of the media and the public's growing interest with disasters coverage, stating that Detroit's representation as a fallen city, grabs our attention through the decontextualizing nature of the photograph, both baffling and fascinating us.² While other scholars, journalists and commentators wish to take a more pragmatic approach to Detroit's representation interpreting these ruins as "blank canvasses" of opportunity and investment.

What is so central in this discussion is the duality by which these representations are constructed. As a city, Detroit was built upon the ideals of the American Dream as exemplified by the auto industry and Henry Ford's production model, however it is also simultaneously demonstrative of the extremes of capitalism's influence existing in monopolistic form. Detroit's popularity as a representation of demise is simply a premonition satisfying what author and journalist Rebecca Solnit defines as a "post-American" city.³ In other words, Detroit's representation exemplifies a reality about America we often choose to ignore, one demonstrating what Detroit resident, journalist and author Charlie Le Duff describes as the beginnings of America's collapse as a former "empire."⁴

Today the "post American" city of Detroit has generated a frenzy of images. This popularity and interest reached staggering heights following the housing crisis, with Detroit serving as a cautionary model for potential widespread economic collapse. In the days following the 2009 recession, coverage of Detroit's decay became overwhelming, traversing the line from noteworthy to exploitive thus prompting residents, scholars, journalists and politicians to express extreme trepidation regarding such imagery. James Griffioen, a Detroit resident, blogger and photographer, coined the term "ruin porn" in an article in *Vice Magazine* by contributing journalist, Thomas Morton to describe America's fascination with these images controversial use as documents and their role in aestheticizing disaster.⁵ Today a majority of ruin imagery of Detroit is inherently controversial, generating a host of commentary as well as critique.

What is so intriguing about the ruin imagery of Detroit is the level of controversy engendered by an abundance of conflicted encoded meaning. While there is now a plethora of images of abandoned structures, my research focuses upon specifically the iconic images published by photographer Andrew Moore in *Detroit Disassembled*. I have chosen these specific photographs because they have already been accepted by the art world as cultural productions with aesthetic value.

Whether in novels, painting, photographs or film, we are seduced as a culture more than ever by narratives centralizing destruction, collapse, apocalypse, and war. If we limit this investigation to a mere critique and condemnation, or simply indulge in ruin aesthetics, we also limit our ability to understand these images within the broader context of society, knowledge and power. Thus by taking these images seriously as intersecting with advanced capitalism, we better understand Detroit as exemplary of the rise and fall of American idealism.

B. Statement of the Problem

One of the more nuanced questions Moore's *Detroit Disassembled* asks, is what exactly what do we value for our postindustrial future spaces? As a life long resident of Michigan, I grew up in a city whose urban center was comprised of large pockets of blight, disenfranchisement and poverty, while new investments and developments were directed at the city's periphery, constructing malls, supercenters and megastores. Today, like Detroit and other rust belt regions, this relationship is shifting, the city's suburban and commercial sprawl has halted and rather new investment, revenue and tax incentives are being directed at the long lost historical downtown. This new wealth presents a paradoxical picture as both higher standards of living and improved commercial and community services generate an uplifting narrative of the downtown's revitalization. However, at the same time this all comes at the expense of greater social and economic disparities for lower income residence once affordable housing can no longer be

found. Postindustrial ruins inherently juxtapose these conflicting dualities as the presentation of fallen space inherently signifies a future, and by placing this future within the context of the ruin—a space void of social and economic justice and equality, it also presents us with a conception of future space outside of its former democratic identity. My analysis will get to the core of this duality applying Moore’s ruin imagery in juxtaposition with space’s new character in the redeveloping city of Detroit.

Another propelling question Moore’s *Detroit Disassembled* presents, is what value—if any, do images aestheticizing disaster maintain? Among scholars critically evaluating “ruin porn,” the most common response to this question is one of dismissal and critique. Scholar’s basing their argument predominately upon ruin imagery’s aestheticizing nature, decontextualizing blight into a form of entertainment, ruin imagery such as Moore’s is labeled as having very little value outside of this critique. In *Beautiful Terrible Ruins: Detroit and the Anxiety of Decline*, Dora Apel takes a more nuanced position of “ruin porn” contending that a more productive response to images of such provocation is one that rather “examine[s] the larger social and cultural roles images play.”⁶ Apel sees a way forward with this genre prescribing a value to it which neither boosts nor criticizes Detroit’s ruins, but rather deciphers “how ruin imagery obscures or reveals the ongoing relations of capital, power and the city.”⁷ Moore’s *Detroit Disassembled* is inherently controversial and provocative. However, as Apel suggests discarding and dismissing these images limits our ability to obtain value from them.

Jason Sperb in “The End of Detroipia: Fordist Nostalgia and the Ambivalence of Poetic Ruins in Visions of Detroit” describes this critical space ruin imagery constructs as “liminal,”⁸ depicting space’s uncomfortable but yet very important history by “freezing”⁹ it into the document. By approaching Moore’s *Detroit Disassembled* within Sperb’s perspective, as a moment in space’s history “frozen,” my analysis will go forward exploring the potential

meanings ruins convey. In addition, I will not be engaging in a conversation of ruin imagery's value but will rather separate the aesthetics of Moore's images from the subject matters they depict. Hence, as Apel suggest, ruin imagery offers an inquiry into real space's ever evolving re-appropriation into places of function, capital and power.

The third propelling question Moore's *Detroit Disassembled* presents, is how do we respond to images featuring social and economic collapse? Today a handful of iconic photographs have shaped the way blight is visualized and understood in American culture, however in these image's reception they are often labeled within the futile categories of dystopian or apocalyptic. I believe these categorizations are unconstructive and limiting, inhibiting ruin imagery's further exploration by simplifying the complexities inherent to ruins into conventionalized popular cultural meanings. By applying such binary terminology (utopian vs. dystopian) we are essentially practicing and reinforcing the same logic contributing to a space's ruination. As Shannon Lee Dawdy contends in "Clockpunk Anthropology and the Ruins of Modernity," we need to begin to interpret the modern ruin, not just functionless but enlightening, containing an array of discursive and potentially new meanings.¹⁰ In my analysis of Moore's *Detroit Disassembled*, I will be approaching industrial ruination similarly to that of Dawdy, maintaining an open-minded and objective point of view, observing the variety of meanings ruination can construct.

The last propelling question Moore's *Detroit Disassembled* presents is how do we approach Detroit's historical and iconic ruination in a manner that does not localize, isolate or direct this conversation specifically to one city? Apel associates this localization as symptomatic to America's relationship with global capitalism; she contends that by concentrating on a singular example we divert our attention from our own anxieties and potential vulnerabilities onto a safe and removed source.¹¹ Apel asserts, "ruin images are meant to soothe and domesticate

the sense of brokenness, fragmentation, and violence at the core of ruination.”¹² This approach however, is only a coping mechanism permitting individuals to retreat from reality. My analysis will examine images of Detroit’s blight as symptomatic, interpreting these spaces as one of the first examples of neoliberal capitalism pressed to its extremes. It is within the core objective of this paper to engage Detroit’s ruination in conversation with the broader and systemic regional trends occurring in America’s cities today. Thus I will be interpreting economic downturn and collapse in the broader sense, examining the structures of capitalism and holding these factors accountable.

C. Purpose and Objectives.

The purpose of this paper is to answer the following questions: what encoded meanings in modern space are revealed through its depiction in Moore’s *Detroit Disassembled* in ruination, and what does industrial ruination say about advanced capitalism today? To answer this question, I will analyze one image, *Former “Splatball City” paint ball arena, Packard Motor Car Company plant* (Fig.1) as maintaining three central themes in Moore’s anthology; economic, societal and cultural collapse. *Former “Splatball City”* depicts a compounded picture of the mounting fluxes of capitalism in America over the last sixty years through both its originating identity in the Packard Plant to its more recent identity as a postindustrial ruin and space of amusement. Furthermore, this juxtaposition of identities and uses within the context of this space’s intentional design, one predicated on modernist values of simplicity, functionality, and light, constructs a paradoxical relationship between its former emphasis on order, consumption and economic strength in opposition to its current emphasis on disorder, waste and impermanence.

Another purpose of this paper will be to answer the question: how can these new meanings be reapplied into a contextual understanding of modern space by evaluating the

Packard Plant's current redevelopment and reopening this year? To answer this question, I will juxtapose the new meanings I have obtained from *Former "Splatball City"* to the Packard Plant's current redevelopment into spaces of commerce and leisure. This juxtaposition is crucial, providing a critical and theoretical interpretation of modern capitalism, by grounding perception within two contradictory spatial realities: the ruin and the revitalized urban space.

III. Literature Review

One of the most comprehensive analyses of ruin photography is by Detroit resident and art historian Dora Apel in the aforementioned book *Beautiful Terrible Ruins*. Apel reframes the discussion of Detroit and representation by placing the array of photographs, art installations and recent documentaries featuring Detroit within a context examining the city's past four decades of economic decline. In addition, Apel's analyzes both sides of the "ruin porn" controversy, examining it outside of its narrow aesthetic value, while at the same time remaining conscientious of its potentially dehumanizing effects. Ruin imagery, Apel affirms may offer boarder "ideological implications"¹³ for society and it is of great importance to examine these implications, no matter how disheartening and difficult.

My analysis will proceed forward in a similar way, interpreting Moore's images in a framework conscientious of their controversy that neither dismisses nor defends them, but rather approaches them in an objective manner. Apel is a central source to this analysis both through her contextual and historical analysis of Detroit as well as through her careful considerations of the current and past political forces shaping the city. Where this analysis will differ however, is within its range of scope. Apel examining Detroit and ruination through a variety of lenses cast a large sociological net to decipher meaning behind Detroit's ruins. My focus is entirely predicated on Moore's anthology alone, focusing in on one epitomizing image, *Former "Splatball City."*

Two additional scholars central to this analysis is Andrew Emil Gansky's text "Ruin Porn and the Ambivalence of Decline: Andrew Moore's Photographs of Detroit" and the abovementioned text by Jason Sperb "The End of *Detropia*." In both Gansky and Sperb's texts, two comparable controversial types of ruin imagery are examined, *Detropia*, a film focusing on the ruination in Detroit often employing lengthy voyeuristic shots is similar in genre to that of Moore's photographs. Sperb, insisting on a value of *Detropia* outside of its potential voyeurism, argues that the "representation of the ruin can provoke critical reflection regardless of the intention."¹⁴ Both Gansky and Sperb interpret their subjects within an objective framework, educing meaning from their content alone and thus engaging in a dialogue considering the broader issues these works portray. In Gansky text, several important inferences into Moore's subject are generated; the most critical of his conjectures alludes to modern ruination as a signifier for America's collapsing social safety nets.¹⁵ In a related note, Sperb analyzing scenes in *Detropia* refers to many of the ruins in the film as "*abandoned* work displays,"¹⁶ inferring that these "displays" point to Western society's transformation from an industrial based economy to one of a "leisure-based" economy.¹⁷

Sperb and Gansky's approaches to their subjects and the substance to their conclusions are important in my analysis of Moore's work, since it seems fairly evident that the images in *Detroit Disassembled* quintessentially depict a fallen economic and social order. The crucial difference between my analysis and their work however is context, as my text focuses largely upon the characteristics of ruined space, such as entropy, trash and temporalities to configure my arguments.

In both Miles Orvell's text "Photographing Disaster: Urban Ruins and the Destructive Sublime" and Sarah Arnold's text "Urban Decay Photography and Film Fetishism and the Apocalyptic Imagination" a wider sociological framework of ruin imagery is discussed. Both

Arnold and Orvell's texts engage in a critical dialogue of ruin aesthetics, thus aid in placing Moore's *Detroit Disassembled* within context of its documentary value. Miles Orvell commenting specifically on an exterior shot of the Packard Plant in *Detroit Disassembled* describes the image as one portraying a "colossal still life"¹⁸ memorializing mass production's obsolesces.¹⁹ Along similar lines, Arnold's text identifies ruin imagery as a sort of "fetishistic,"²⁰ aesthetic, singling out and recording one destructive moment in time.

Arnold and Orvell's texts both position their arguments within a critique format. Although this is not within the objectives of my analysis, these author's ability to place their critiques within a thorough and considerate intellectual debate allows for my analysis to construct a firm argument around *Detroit Disassembled's* effectiveness in fixing a moment of space's unflattering history. Hence, by "fetishizing," the destructive, Moore's image's can be utilized as reminders of what current and future functional spaces conceal.

The last collection of literature central to my analysis concerns itself specifically with the current conditions in the city of Detroit and its undergoing redevelopment projects. Today the images in Moore's *Detroit Disassembled* are mere memories of Detroit's former troubled history, as the last five years the city has experienced a massive wave of restructuring and reinvestment. Presently, the general consensus of the public to these project's legislation ("Detroit Works Project" and the "Detroit Future City Project")²¹ are positive, interpreting them as beneficial to the city's economic stability and future growth. However, there is a small facet of Academics studying Detroit's proposed redevelopment, who outline the potential damaging and harmful consequences blight elimination and renewal projects create for the city's poorer residents. Professors Gloria House, Lucas Owen Kirkpatrick as well as Apel warn that the projects and programs underway today in Detroit are alarmingly unbalanced, either lead by government appointed emergency managers or corporate backed revitalization programs. They

assert that redevelopment is transforming the city into an unevenly structured landscape, marked by isolated pockets of poverty with that of more affluent and prosperous districts. Seth Schindler analyzing the “Detroit Works Project” equates its agenda with Harvey’s theory of the newly emerging “entrepreneurial city,”²² contending that the former communal character of Detroit is now being transforming into one occupied and controlled by corporate elites and CEOs.

House, Kirkpatrick, Apel and Schindler’s conjectures point to a broader argument in scholarship examining the nature of space in America’s cities and towns today once community governance yields to corporate influences and financing. In this analysis, I will be using their ideas to emphasize the inherent meanings behind ruination, by indexing the spatial-temporal fluxes of capitalism in space. In addition, these scholars’ concentration on the corporate influences embedded into the city’s redevelopment programs contextualize blight and the ruin as current strategic mediums to modern capitalism, highlighting space as the commodity’s new value.

IV. Methodology

In my analysis of *Former “Splatball City”* I will be employing an integrated critical theoretical approach based upon Henri Lefebvre’s methods to space outlined in *The Production of Space* and its reinterpretation by Edward W. Soja in *Thirdspace: Journeys to Los Angeles and Other Real-and-Imagined Places*. These texts are key to my analysis in decoding modern space, as *Former “Splatball City”* depicts a former industrial space contrasted by three subsequent post-functional spaces, of the ruin, paintball course and the dump. Hence, Lefebvre and Soja’s models can be understood within three varying historical phases of this space in order to illuminate varying degrees of capitalism in society.

As the former Packard Plant Headquarters, Moore’s image depicts what Lefebvre refers to as “abstract space,”²³ embodying a space where the *spatial practices*,²⁴ or uses of it reflect its

composition through their structural representation—or a *representation of space*.²⁵ In the Packard Plant this is communicated through its design, envisioning modernist architectural principles of simplicity and utility, the plant exudes its production model by unifying form with function. Lefebvre defines modern architectural design in terms of a “new consciousness of space,”²⁶ thus its *spatial practices*, or the assembly line is reflected in its *representation of space*, whereas the plant’s clarity of line signifies production, its standardization of form, signifies the commodity, and the box-like window paned facades, signify the artifice of the commodity. Soja, analyzing Lefebvre’s theories on space defines this as “Secondspace,”²⁷ stating that the dominating episteme (capitalism) constructing *representations of space* tends towards a form of social-spatiality,²⁸ whereas “the medium” of space is also the “outcome of human activity.”²⁹ Hence, production and consumption dominate spaces where historical-natural space has retreated, allowing human spatiality to convene within one dialogue—capitalism. A firm understanding of “abstract space” is needed for comprehending the qualities of ruination as a comparative tool to contextualize the ruin within space’s larger framework.

Another important aspect to *Former “Splatball City”* is the current state of ruination the Packard Plant is depicted; in my analysis this will be understood through Lefebvre’s third level of space.³⁰ Lefebvre, seeking to re-conceptualize space’s value outside of its pacified identity, describes a new method, identifying this space as a *representational space*.³¹ According to Lefebvre *representational space* exists outside of the homogenized and dominating spatial identities indicative to capitalist ideology, or “abstract space,” and rather is identified by one “directly lived though”³² by “its associated images and symbols.”³³ Through this junction, a space emerges between the real and the unreal, to reverse “abstract space’s” significations and rather embed it into new symbolic values. In *Former “Splatball City,”* Lefebvre’s *representational space* will be applied in in two central ways.

The first is based upon the dialectic created when the photograph depicts a subject matter that is both extraordinary and temporal. Thus, the ephemerality of the photograph's subject matter and the dynamism of the ruin combine to construct a *representational space*. Thus, the photo exists in a phase of reality between a profound truth through its documentation of the ruin, as well as outside of reality in its historical vantage point—it is symbolic. The second way this concept of *representational space* will be utilized is within Soja's theoretical interpretation of it. Soja, defining Lefebvre's *representational space* as "thirdspace"³⁴ emphasizes the value of its materiality through this "thirthing-as-Othering."³⁵ In other words, in *Former "Splatball City"* "thirthing-as-othering" constitutes a different value of a *representational space*, one existing between the dialectic of past space embedded in the photo of the ruin and present space embedded in the Packard Plant's redevelopment. Hence a space of "othering" is constructed between the image and the real—a "thirdspace."

V. Chapter Overviews

1. Chapter One: The Disunion of Form and Function, Spaces of Disorder

The objective of this first chapter is to examine one of the central strategies of the Packard Plant's design, the unification of form and function and the conditions it is depicted in *Former "Splatball City."* In sum, I will be examining "abstract space's" emphasis on the unification of the production model as a strategy of space, and reframing this within the different dialectics the industrial ruin presents. This will be done in three ways. 1. The prominence of line emphasized in the ceiling tiles juxtaposed with broken, disparate and discontinuous line in trash. 2. The standardization of form emphasized in the steel frame windowpanes juxtaposed with the broken and the mended. 3. And the sequence of form emphasized in the concrete supports system juxtaposed with the disruption of graffiti. My objective is to interpret this disharmony in modernist architecture as a dialectic between the efficiency of the production model and its

current form. I will be framing this within the following question: What can these symbolic properties indicate about capitalism in the context of the Packard Plant superimposed by a paintball course?

2. Chapter Two: The Box vs. Rubbish, Spaces of Conspicuous Exchange

The objective of this chapter is to examine another central strategy of the Packard Plant's design, its box-like form, juxtaposed in *Former "Splatball City"* with rubbish. In sum, I will be examining this commodity-like design within the dialectic constructed by the industrial ruin: conspicuous consumption versus conspicuous exchange (rubbish is the simplified version of the commodity existing entirely on one side of the production model). This dialectic will be studied by examining the two main components of the Packard Plant's structural materiality, concrete and glass (the box) with that of the two main components generated through its ruination, plastic and cardboard. My objective is to examine the symbolism embedded in materiality existing as "a means to an end" and to re-understand the consumer model outside of production's prominence in capitalism. I will be framing these new understandings within the following question: What can these symbolic properties indicate about capitalism within the context of this box-like design depicted as the discarded remains of "Splatball City"?

3. Chapter Three: Light, Spaces of a Makeshift Culture

The objective of this section is to examine the central strategy in the Packard Plant's design, its emphasis on light, indicative of its walls of steel framed windows. In sum, I will be examining "abstract space's" emphasis on openness, depicted in *Former "Splatball City"* as a dialectical between transparency and solidity (windows) with that of the provisional tarp. The tarps, a temporary installation by the former tenants of the paintball course, supported a potentially damaging use of this space while at the same time protected the structural integrity of the windows while still omitting light. The tarps are a tactical method negating this larger

strategy of space, my objective is to examine the symbolism embedded in the provisional and tactical uses of space to understand the precariousness of its “users”³⁶ and “inhabitants.”³⁷ What can these symbolic properties indicate about capitalism in the context of this space of “users” and “inhabitants” with that of its redevelopment today as a space of leisure and commerce?

VI. Conclusion

My analysis of Moore’s photograph, *Former “Splatball City”* will proceed forward with the following objectives and purposes. The first objective will be to examine the compounded picture of capitalism *Former “Splatball City”* conveys by analyzing the symbolic value of space in between function and ruination, or one of *representational* value. In addition, I will next be analyzing *Former “Splatball City”* within juxtaposition to the Packard Plant’s redevelopment, to reconfigure meaning in between the ruin and spaces of urban revitalization, or “thirdspace.” To accomplish these objectives, I will be examining the following juxtapositions in *Former “Splatball City:”* form, function and order versus entropy, conspicuous consumption versus conspicuous exchange, and light and stability versus spaces of translucence and temporality. It is my assertion that Moore’s *Detroit Disassembled* once analyzed through Lefebvre’s and Soja’s method constructs critical insights into capitalism’s weaknesses and contradictions shedding light onto the origins of some central systemic societal inequities and injustices in space.

Image Appendix



Fig. 1. Former “Splatball City” paint ball arena, Packard Motor Company plant. 2010. From *Detroit Disassembled*. Moore, Andrew. Akron Ohio: Akron Art Museum. 2010. Page 16.

Notes

- 1 Jerry Herron, *After Culture: Detroit and the Humiliation of History* (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 1993), 100.
- 2 Woodward, Richard, "Disaster Photography: When is documentary Exploitation?" *Art News* (February 6, 2013), <http://www.artnews.com/2013/02/06/the-debate-over-ruin-porn/>.
- 3 Rebecca Solnit, "Detroit Arcadia: Exploring the Post-American Landscape," *Harper's Magazine*, July (2007), 65.
- 4 Thomas Morton, "Something, Something, Something, Detroit." *Vice Magazine*, July 31 (2009).
- 5 Morton, "Something."
- 6 Dora Apel, *Beautiful Terrible Ruins: Detroit and the Anxiety of Decline* (New Brunswick, New Jersey and London: Rutgers University Press, 2015), 24.
- 7 *Ibid.*, 26.
- 8 Jason Sperd, "The End of Detropia: Fordist Nostalgia and the Ambivalence of Poetic Ruins in Visions of Detroit," *Journal of American Culture* 39, no.2 (2016): 22.
- 9 *Ibid.*, 222.
- 10 Shannon Lee Dawdy, "Clockpunk Anthropology and the Ruins of Modernity," *Current Anthropology* 51, no. 6 (2010): 768.
- 11 Apel, *Beautiful Terrible*, 100.
- 12 *Ibid.*, 100.
- 13 *Ibid.*, 24.
- 14 Sperb, "The End of *Detropia*," 222.
- 15 Andrew Gansky, "Ruin Porn and the Ambivalence of Decline: Andrew Moore's Photographs of Detroit," *Photography & Culture* 7, no. 2 (2014): 122.
- 16 Sperb, "The End of *Detropia*," 226.
- 17 *Ibid.*, 226.
- 18 Miles Orvell, "Photographing Disaster: Urban Ruins and the Destructive Sublime," 58, no.4 (2013): 653.

- 19 Orvel, "Photographing Disaster," 653.
- 20 Sarah Arnold, "Urban Decay Photography and Film: Fetishism and the Apocalyptic Imagination," *Journal of Urban History* 41, no. 2 (2015): 336.
- 21 The "Detroit Works Project" and the "Detroit Future City Project" are the recent infrastructure and building projects underway in the city of Detroit.
- 22 Seth Schindler, "Detroit After Bankruptcy: A Case of Degrowth Machine Politics." *Urban Studies* 53, no. 4 (2016): 820.
- 23 Henri Lefebvre, *The Production of Space*, Translated by Donald Nicholson-Smith (Oxford: Blackwell:1994), 49.
- 24 Ibid.,38.
- 25 Ibid., 38-39.
- 26 Ibid., 23.
- 27 Edward W. Soja, *Thirdspace, Journeys to Los Angeles and Other Real-and-Imagined Places*, (Malden, Oxford, Victoria and Australia: Blackwell, 1996), 66.
- 28 Ibid., 66.
- 29 Ibid., 66.
- 30 Lefebvre, *The Production of Space*, 39.
- 31 Ibid., 39.
- 32 Ibid., 39.
- 33 Ibid.,39.
- 34 Soja, *Thirdspace*, 66-67.
- 35 Ibid., 81.
- 36 Lefebvre, *The Production of Space*, 39.
- 37 Ibid., 39.

Bibliography

- Aelbrecht, Wes. "Decline and Renaissance: Photographing Detroit in the 1940s and 1980s." *Journal of Urban History* 41, no. 2 (2015): 307-325.
- Apel, Dora. *Beautiful Terrible Ruins: Detroit and the Anxiety of Decline*. New Brunswick, New Jersey and London: Rutgers University Press, 2015.
- Arnold, Sarah. "Urban Decay Photography and Film: Fetishism and the Apocalyptic Imagination." *Journal of Urban History* 41, no. 2 (2015): 326-339.
- Atkinson, Joshua and Clayton Rosati. "DetroitYES! and the Fabulous Ruins Virtual Tour: The Role of Diffused Intertextual Production in the Construction of Alternative Cityscapes." *Critical Studies in Media Communication* 29, no. 1 (2012): 45-64.
- Barndt, Kersti. "Layers of Time: Industrial Ruins and Exhibitionary Temporalities." *Modern Language Association of America* 125, no.1 (2010): 134-141.
- Baran A. Paul and Paul M Sweezy. *Monopoly Capital*. New York and London: Modern Reader Paperbacks, 1966.
- Baudrillard, Jean, *The Mirror of Production*. Translated by Mark Poster. St. Louis: Telos Press, 1975.
- Beck, Ulrich. *Risk Society: Towards a New Modernity*. Translated by Mark Ritter. London, Newbury Park, New Delhi: Sage Publications, 1992.
- Berman, Marshall. *All That is Solid Melts Into Air: The Experience of Modernity*. London: Penguin Books, 1988.
- Blackmar, Elizabeth. "Modernist Ruins." *American Quarterly* 53, no. 2 (2001): 324-339.
- Borshuk, Michael. "True Tales and 8 Mile: Exploring the Imaginary City of Detroit." *Studies in Literacy Imagination* 41, no 1 (2008): 107-134.
- Boyle, Kevin. "The Ruins of Detroit: Exploring the Urban Crisis in the Motor City." *The Michigan Historical Review* 27, no. 3 (2001): 109-127.
- Braae, Ellen. *Beauty Redeemed: Recycling Post-Industrial Landscapes*. Berlin: Birkhäuser Verlag, 2015.
- Brent D. Ryan and Daniel Campo. "Autopia's End: The Decline and Fall of Detroit's Automotive Manufacturing Landscape." *Journal of Planning History* 12, no. 2 (2013):95-132.
- Buck-Morss, Susan. *The Dialectics of Seeing: Walter Benjamin and the Arcades Project*. Cambridge and London: MIT Press, 1991.

- Chanan, Michael. "Detroit: Ruin of a City: A Reception Diary." *Journal of Media Practice* 6, no. 3 (2014): 135-144.
- Clarke, Susan. E, and Gary L. Gaile. *The Work of Cities, Globalization and Communities Vol. 1*. Minneapolis and London: University of Minnesota Press, 1998.
- Coppage, Jonathan. "Detroit Never Died: When the City Government Went Bankrupt Citizens Kept Rebuilding." *The American Conservative* 15, no. 5 (2016): 38-40.
- Cowie, Jefferson and Joseph Heathcott. *Beyond the Ruins: Meanings of Deindustrialization*. Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press, 2003.
- Dawdy, Shannon Lee. "Clockpunk Anthropology and the Ruins of Modernity." *Current Anthropology* 51, no. 6 (2010): 761-93.
- De Certeau, Michel. *The Practice of Everyday Life*. Translated by Steven F. Randall. Berkley: University California Press, 1988.
- Desimini, Jill. "Limitations of the Temporary: Landscapes and Abandonment." *Journal of Urban History* 41, no. 2 (2015): 279-293.
- Draus, Paul and Juliette Roddy. "Ghost, Devils, and the Undead City: Detroit and the Narrative of Monstrosity." *Space and Culture Journal* 19, no.1 (2016): 67-79.
- Edensor, Tim. *Industrial Ruins: Spaces, Aesthetics and Materiality*. New York and Oxford: Berg, 2005.
- . "The Ghosts of Industrial Ruins: Ordering and Disordering Memory In Excessive Space." *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 34, no. 4 (2006): 829-49.
- . "Vernacular Workplace Culture: The Ghosts of Collectivity Haunt the Future." *Borderlands* 10, no. 2 (2011): 1-14.
- . "Waster Matter: The Debris of Industrial Ruins and the Disordering of the Material World." *Journal of Material Culture* 10, no. 3 (2005): 311-333.
- Fassi, A. "Industrial Ruins, Urban Exploring, and the Postindustrial Picturesque." *The New Centennial Review* 10, no.1 (2010):141-152.
- Fisher, Mark. *Capitalist Realism: Is There No Alternative?.* United Kingdom: Zero Books, 2009.
- Foucault, Michel. *Aesthetics, Method and Epistemology: Volume II*, edited by James D. Faubion. Translated by Robert Hurley and others. New York: The New Press, 1994:175-185.
- . *The Order of Things: An Archeology of the Human Sciences*. Translated from *Les Mots et les choses*. New York: Vintage Books-Random House, 1994.

- Galster, George. *Driving Detroit: The Quest for Respect in the Motor City*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2012.
- Gansky, Andrew. "Ruin Porn and the Ambivalence of Decline: Andrew Moore's Photographs of Detroit." *Photography & Culture* 7, no. 2 (2014): 119-139.
- Georgakas, Dan. "Detroit: An Urban Zombie." *Cineaste* 37, no. 4 (2012): 16-22.
- Habermas, Jurgen. *The Structural Transformation of the Public Sphere: An Inquiry into a Category of Bourgeois Society*. Translated by Thomas Burger and Frederick Lawrence, Cambridge: MIT Press, 1998.
- Harvey, David. *A Brief History of Neoliberalism*. New York: Oxford, 2007.
- . *Rebel Cities: From the Right to the City to the Urban Revolution*. New York and London: Verso, 2013.
- . *The Condition of Postmodernity*. Cambridge and Oxford: Blackwell, 1990.
- . *The Enigma of Capital, and the Crisis of Capitalism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011.
- Hell, Julia and Andreas Schonle. *Ruins of Modernity*. Durham and London: Duke University Press, 2010.
- Herron, Jerry. *After Culture: Detroit and the Humiliation of History*. Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 1993.
- Hetherington, Kevin. "Secondhandedness: Consumption, Disposal, and the Absent Presence." *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 22, (2004): 157-173.
- . *The Badlands of Modernity: Heterotopia and Social Ordering*. London and New York: Routledge, 1997.
- Hetzler, Florence. "The Aesthetics of Ruins: A New Category of Being." *The Journal of Aesthetics and Education* 16, no. 2 (Summer 1982): 105-108.
- High Steven. "Beyond Aesthetics: Visibility and Invisibility in the Aftermath of Deindustrialization." *International Labor & Working-Class History* 84, Fall (2013): 140-153.
- High, Steven and David W. Lewis. *Corporate Wasteland: The Landscape and Memory of Deindustrialization*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2007.
- Horkheimer, Max. "The End of Reason." in *The Essential Frankfurt School Reader*, edited by Andrew Arato and Eike Gebhardt. New York: Continuum, 1982: 26-48.

- House, Gloria. "Global Detroit, Race, Democracy and Corporate Power." *Peace and Freedom* 74, no. 2 (2014): 12-13.
- Jacobs, Jane. *Dark Age Ahead*. New York: Random House, 2004.
- . *The Death and Life of Great American Cities*. Vintage Books Edition, New York: Vintage Books, 1992.
- Jameson, Frederic. "Future City." *New Left Review* 21, May and June (2003): 65-79.
- Kirpatrick, Owen. "Urban Triage, City Systems and the Remnants of Community: Some Sticky Complications in the Greening of Detroit." *Journal of Urban History* 41, no. 2 (2015): 261-278.
- Kozloff, Max. "A Planet of Relics." *Art in America* 99, no. 1 (2011): 53-60.
- Kunstler, James Howard. "Requiem For Detroit." *AMASS* 18, no. 1 (2013): 38-39.
- Landzeluis, Michael. "Commemorative Dis(re)membering: Erasing Heritage, Spatializing Disinheritance." *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 21, 2003: 195-221.
- Leary, John Patrick. "Detroitism." *Guernica*, January 15, 2011.
- LeDuff, Charlie. *Detroit: An American Autopsy*. New York: Penguin Books, 2013.
- Lefebvre, Henri. *The Production of Space*. Translated by Donald Nicholson-Smith. Oxford: Blackwell, 1994.
- . *The Urban Revolution*. Translated by Robert Bononno. Foreword by Neil Smith. Minneapolis and London: University of Minnesota Press, 2003.
- . *Towards an Architecture of Enjoyment*, edited by Łukasz Stanek. Translated by Robert Bononno. Minneapolis and London: University of Minnesota Press, 2014.
- Lewandowski, Joseph D. "Rescuing Critique: On the Ghetto Photography of Camillo Vergara." *Theory, Culture & Society* 25, no. 7-8 (2008): 285-308.
- Lozowy, Anrinko. "Picturing Industrial Landscapes." *Space and Culture* 17, no. 4 (2014): 388-397.
- Mah, Alice. *Industrial Ruination, Community, and Place: Landscapes and Legacies of Urban Decline*. Toronto, Buffalo and London: University of Toronto Press, 2012.
- Marr, Stephen. "Worlding and Wilding: Lagos and Detroit as Global Cities." *Race and Class, Institute of Race Relations* 57, no. 4 (2016): 3-21.
- Martin, Randy. *The Financialization of Daily Life*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 2002.

- Marx, Karl. *Capital Volume I: A Critique of Political Economy*. Translated by Ben Fowkes, London: Penguin Classics, 1990.
- . *Capital Volume II: A Critique of Political Economy*. Translated by David Fernbach. London: Penguin Classics, 1992.
- . *Capital Volume III: A Critique of Political Economy*. Translated by David Fernbach. London: Penguin Classics, 1991.
- Marx, Karl and Friedrich Engels. “The Eighteenth Brumaire of Louis Bonaparte.” *The Communist Manifesto and Other Writings*, edited by George Stader. New York: Barnes and Noble Classics, 2005: 63-169.
- McClanahan, A. “Archaeologies of Collapse: New Conceptions of Ruination in Northern Britain.” *Visual Culture in Britain* 15, no. 2 (2014): 198-213.
- McCulloch, Michael. “Interpreting Abandoned Sites: Administrative, Market, and Grassroots Frameworks.” *Journal of Urban History* 40, no. 5 (2014): 1000-1005.
- McGraw, Bill. “Life in the Ruins of Detroit.” *History Workshop Journal* 63, no.1 (2007): 288-02.
- Merrifield, Andy. “The Urban Question Under Planetary Urbanization.” *The International Journal of Urban and Regional Research* 37, no. 3 (2013): 909-922.
- Moone, Whitney. “Reclaiming the Ruin: Detroit’s Second Coming?” *Places: Forum of Design for the Public Realm* 21, no. 1 (2009): 36-41.
- Moore, Andrew. *Detroit Disassembled; Essay by Philip Levine*. Bologna: Akron Art Museum and Damiani, 2010.
- . “Urban Archeology and Commentary by Andrew Moore.” *Aperture*, Winter, no. 197 (2009): 46-51.
- Morton, Thomas. “Something, Something, Something, Detroit.” *Vice Magazine*, July 31 (2009).
- Nun, Nathan. “Practical Aesthetics: Community Gardens and the New Sensibility.” *Radical Philosophy Review* 16, no. 2 (2013): 663-667.
- Orvell, Miles. “Photographing Disaster: Urban Ruins and the Destructive Sublime.” *Amerikastudien /American Studies* 58, no. 4 (2013): 647-671.
- . “America in Ruins.” *American Art* 29, no.1 (2015): 9-15.
- Parnaby, Andrew. “Life Among the Ruins: Deindustrialization in Historiographical Perspective.” *Labour/Le Travail* 72, Fall (2013): 279-293.

- Perry, Weena. "To Vibrant for Ruins: Ground Zero Photography and the Problem of the Modern Ruin." *Afterimage* 36, no.3 (2008): 8-12.
- Polanyi, Karl. *The Great Transformation: The Political and Economic Origins of Our Time*. Boston: Beacon Press, 2001.
- Polter, Julie. "Beyond Ruin Porn." *Sojourners Magazine* 42, no. 8 (2013): 40-44.
- Potter, Patrick and WG, Romany. *Beauty in Decay: Urbex*. Darlington: Carpet Bombing Culture, 2010.
- Rojon, Sarah. "Postindustrial Imagery and Digital Networks: Toward New Modes of Urban Preservation?" *Future Anterior* 11, no. 1 (2014): 84.
- Salerno, Roger. *Landscapes of Abandonment: Capitalism, Modernity and Estrangement*. New York: State University of New York Press, 2003.
- Schindler, Seth. "Detroit After Bankruptcy: A Case of Degrowth Machine Politics." *Urban Studies* 53, no. 4 (2016): 818-836.
- Schultz, Joe. "Michigan Central Station, Detroit, 2010." *Technology and Culture* 51, no. 4 (2010): 889-892.
- Schuster, Joshua. "Between Manufacturing and Landscapes: Edward Burtynsky and the Photography of Ecology." *Photography and Culture* 6, no. 2 (2013): 193-212.
- Schrock, Andrew Richard, and Rebecca Sittler. "Like Another World:" Placing Photographic Practices of Urban Explorers." *Exposure* 48, no.1 (2015): 38-43.
- Sennett, Richard. *The Fall of Public Man*. New York: Alfred and Knopf, 1977.
- Simmel, Georg. "Two Essays." *The Hudson Review* 11, no.3 (1958): 371-385.
- . *The Philosophy of Money*. Edited and translated by David Frisby. London and New York: Routledge Classics, 2004.
- Soja, Edward W. *Postmetropolis: Critical Studies of Cities and Regions*. Malden: Blackwell Publishing, 2000.
- . *Postmodern Geographies: The Reassertion of Space in Critical Social Theory*. London and New York: Verso, 1989.
- . *Thirdspace: Journeys to Los Angeles and Other Real-and-Imagined Places*. Malden, Oxford, UK and Victoria, Australia: Blackwell, 1996.
- Solnit, Rebecca. "Detroit Arcadia: Exploring the Post-American Landscape." *Harper's Magazine*, 315 July (2007): 65.

- Sperb, Jason. "The End of *Detropia*: Fordist Nostalgia and the Ambivalence of Poetic Ruins in Visions of Detroit." *Journal of American Culture* 39, no. 2 (2016): 212-227.
- Stallabrass, Julian. *Gargantua: Manufactured Mass Culture*. London and New York: Verso, 1996.
- Staley, Willey. "What's Really Pornographic? The Point of Documenting Detroit." *The Awl*, September 1, 2011.
- Steinmetz, George. "Driver by Shooting: Making a Documentary About Detroit." *Michigan Quarterly Review* 45, no. 3, (2006): 491-513.
- Thompson, Heather Ann. "Rethinking the Politics of White Flight in the Postwar City: Detroit, 1945-1980." *Journal of Urban History* 25, no. 2 (1999): 163-198.
- Trigg, Dylan. *The Aesthetics of Decay: Nothingness, Nostalgia, and the Absence of Reason*. New York: Peter Lang, 2006.
- Vultee, F. "Finding Porn in the Ruin." *Journal Of Mass Media Ethics* 28, no. 2 (2013): 142-145.
- Weber, Max. *The Theory of Social and Economic Organization*. Edited by Talcott Parsons. Translated by A.M. Henderson. Mansfield Centre: Martino Publishing, 2012.
- Woodward, Christopher. "Learning From Detroit: The Wrong Kind of Ruin." *Urban Wildscapes*. Edited by Anna Jorgensen and Richard Keenan. London and New York: Routledge, 2012:17-32.
- Woodward, Richard. "Disaster Photographahy: When is documentary Exploitation?." *Art News*, February 6, 2013. <http://www.artnews.com/2013/02/06/the-debate-over-ruin-porn/>.
- Yablonsky, Linda. "Art Motors On." *W* 40, no. 11 (2011): 116.
- Yeoman, Barry. "The Death and Life of Detroit." *The American Prospect* 23, no. 4, (2012): 25-31.